Mapping Philippine Agro-Ecological Zones (AEZS)

COMMENT 3

NOTE: Some of my concerns have already been address in the revised project document and response to comments. The following need to be address or incorporated in the document.

1. Review of Literature

Create a separate section for the review of literature. Literature review in this project are imbedded in the introduction, rationale and methodology

2. FAO AEZ

What is the significant difference of this mapping activities to that of the FAO AEZ maps. This should be clearly stated in the document.

3. HDN AEZ

Based on the project rationale HDN indicated that the climate component should include (1) radiation, (2) rainfall, (3) temperature, and (4) humidity. All four variables are available in the PAGASA database and yet only two variables were included. What ever output this project is showing is short of what is required in the HDN guidelines.

The project only describes spatial correlation between AEZ and HDI. Statistical analysis could also be done between HDI and AEZ. For example, if the HDI is based political boundaries (province) then the AEZ could also be generated by province and its attributes could be use for statistical analysis.

4. Methodology

There was no mention of the scale of the source map, e.g. NAMRIA and other thematic maps.

Soil map is available at the BSWM, while slope map with the DENR, why use the general soil classification map and generated slope map?

While this project pointed out scarcity of data as shown in the output of the temperature and rainfall data where grid cell size is too large, the output could have been better if PAGASA data have been included in the analysis.

6. Agro Ecological Zone

The output AEZ is bias towards annual crops (rice and corn) cultivated in the lowlands as pointed out during the peer review. The Provinces of Bukidnon, Davao del Sur, and Davao del Norte have been classified as "Critical soils requiring intensive management-Moist/ Low GDD" when in fact this area is where major plantation and high value crops are grown.

Suggestions:

1. Rethinking classification by using constraints to production as the basis of classification. In doing so, this could be much related to HDI.

2. In the final map forest cover could be overlaid to the AEZ as this area cannot be converted to Agriculture.

3. In the Legend: Please re arrange this, making the dark green on top of the yellow green. From Very suitable to Suitable.

Prepared By:

Esteban C. Godilano, Ph.D.

March 28, 2012